UNIVERSITY of BRADFORD

SENATE

Minutes of the meeting held on 26 April 2023

Members:	Professor Shirley Congdon (Chair)	Nasreen Akhtar	Professor Prathivadi Anand
	Professor Udy Archibong	Dr Keren Bielby-Clarke	Dr Emma Brown
	Professor Engobo Emeseh	Professor Chris Gaffney	Marian Hilditch
	Faiz Ilyas	Mozalfa Ilyas	Professor Zahir Irani
	Professor Rob James	Benjamin Jennings	Yakubu John
	Dr Craig Johnson	Dr Rhys Kelly	Dr Jing Li
	Dr William Martin	Professor Iqbal Mujtaba	Chandni Pamnani
	Colin Pickles	Professor Martin Priest	Amit Rana
	Professor Amir Sharif	Tim Squire-Watt	Professor Karen Stansfield
	Dr Pete Twigg	Paul Watson	Louise Wem
	Elaine Wilkinson	Professor Andrew Wilson	Professor Alastair Wood

In attendance:	Steve Gilley	Director of Infrastructure
	Terry Hartwell	Lay Member of Council and Pro -Chancellor (Observer)
	Andrew Lang	Chief Finance Officer
	Gary McFarlane Name	Deputy Director of People
	Riley Power	University Secretary
	Rachel Trawally	Governance and Projects Officer (Secretary)

Apologies:	Professor Marina Bloj	Professor Felician Campean	Professor Maryann Hardy
	Dr Samina Karim	Bryan Lightowler	Ahmed Malik
	Professor Deborah Roberts	Professor Sankar Sivarajah	Iqra Tabassum

84.22-2 <u>Welcome and apologies for absence (oral report)</u>

84.1   The Chair welcomed new members to their first meeting of the Senate.

84.2   The Chair also welcomed Terry Hartwell, Lay Member of Council and Pro-Chancellor who had been invited to observe the meeting to support Council's role in ensuring the effective operation of academic governance and to gain additional insight in their understanding of the work of the Senate.

85.22-23 **Chair's report (Document SEN073/22-23)**

85.1 The Vice-Chancellor noted her report that set out updates on key matters affecting the University, in addition to key engagements of the University.

85.2 The Vice-Chancellor highlighted national conversations being held by the task force set up by Universities UK, led by Jenny Higham the Vice-Chancellor of St George's University of London, regarding funding student fees. Financial pressures Universities were facing included:
- since the 2012 tuition fee reform, fees had remained stagnant at £9259, worth £6585 in real terms.
- Alongside the cost of living crisis, student maintenance packages were at their lowest value in several years.
- In 2015-16 5% of Universities were reporting financial deficit, in 2019-20 this had increased to 32%, and this figure was set to rise.
- Net operating cashflow had decreased from 8.4% of income 2019-20 to 4.2% in 2020-21.

85.3 Alongside financial pressures for Universities, students were also experiencing increased financial pressures with the increased cost of living, some requiring additional jobs and an increased demand on mental health and counselling services were being reported.

85.4 The Vice-Chancellor noted the importance of having a managed growth plan, increasing student numbers and making campus improvements to ensure services provided to students were not compromised.

86.22-23 **Revised KPIs and dashboard (Document SEN074/22-23)**

86.1 The Chief Finance Officer presented the revised KPIs that had been reduced in order to enable effective tracking and provide closer alignment to the University's Strategic Objectives.

86.2 The RAG-rated breakdown of the KPIs against each Strategy were presented, noting that currently six KPI's were red, of which three were only measured on an annual basis due to the data available. It was also noted that 17 were RAG rated green.

86.3 It was explained that after 2023 enrolment the target for home UG FT students and international PGT students, would be changed to headcount and it was expected that home UG FT recruitment would improve for September 2023 enrolments.

86.4 The PVC LTSE provided an update on the LTSE KPIs highlighting the different approach being used for NSS for 2023, with a new four point item specific response scale being used throughout the core questions. Further consultation was being undertaken on future changes to the NSS and it was expected the proposals, if adopted, would allow more meaningful benchmarks.

86.5 A discussion was held around the Research and Innovation KPI in relation to successful grants above £250K. It was confirmed this was correct and that the annual target was unlikely to be met. It was explained that 17 records were still under review, which meant that a number of the projects were still being worked up, of which some may not go through to fruition and others would carry over into next year.

86.6 It was noted that staff turnover was showing as red but this had moved to green in terms of RAG rating. The current staff turnover level was at 7.5%, with one quarter of the year left which was in line with the KPI target.

87.22-23 **Risk Register (Document SEN075/22-23)**

87.1 The University Secretary provided an overview of the report and a discussion ensued in relation to the three risks that related to Senate: to Academic Quality, Research and Innovation and Student Experience.

87.2 The PVC LTSE explained that in relation to Strategic risk 2 - Academic Quality – The University fails to provide a portfolio of well-designed programmes underpinned by high-quality learning, teaching, and assessment practice that deliver successful and reliable academic outcomes for its students, work was underway on the implementation of the nine strands of the Learning, Teaching and Student Experience Strategy and noted Faculties played an essential role in course monitoring. The overall position was satisfactory however there was some concern over a limited number of programmes falling below the 60% threshold target for progression.

87.3 The Deans of the Faculty of Management, Law and Social Sciences and the Faculty of Life Sciences were asked to reflect whether the risk register captured their areas accurately. Both noted progression was a concern and work was underway with colleagues from Careers and programme teams to mitigate this risk.

87.4 The PVC LTSE explained that in relation to Strategic risk 5 – Student Experience – the University fails to provide a high-quality academic, and broader student, experience, an externally designed register identified that the University underperformed in comparison to the sector average in some areas, and scored highly in other areas such as the Library. Proposals were being made through the operational planning round to understand and gain insight at student body and programme level, and interventions were being put in place in relation to student engagement. NSS outcomes would provide further insight when the results were published in the summer.

87.5 The PVC LTSE advised that Turnitin had developed an AI detection interface that would detect the likelihood of AI having been used to produce text in assignments, and it had been agreed to use this, recognising it would only be a test of the integrity of the work. Communications were being put in place and a series of activities were being undertaken to put the necessary tools and guidance in place as quickly as possible. This was a fast-moving area and the University was reviewing integrity

regulations, policies and accompanying guidance along with staying up to date with developments across the sector.

87.6   The PVC R&I highlighted the work being undertaken at an institutional and individual level in relation to Strategic risk 3 - Research and Innovation - levels of activity and quality affect our identity, impact, reputation and income, noting that last year more support was put in place to enhance of the pre-award process, with a focus this year on post award in terms of spending money more efficiently and effectively. Increased training had been put in place on the quality of publications and impact of research. Personal research plans were being produced for individual academics, to help identify how and where support was needed to increase research being undertaken. Noting the importance of individuals and engagement in bids to aid growth within Research.

87.7   A light touch review on research centres would be undertaken to review how they operate as functioning groups to grow research and create new research centres where possible.

87.8   Senate noted the risks presented in the risk register.

88.22-23   **Institutional Growth and Sustainability Plan (Document SEN076/22-23)**

88.1   The DVC presented the Institutional Growth and Sustainability Plan that included a two phase process, phase 1 delivering immediate growth from September 2023 and phase 2 carrying out the development of the plan.

88.2   The eight workstreams that were being developed were presented, noting these aligned to the University Strategy and four sub strategies. These included key areas for rapid growth, an agreed pipeline of new undergraduate and postgraduate programmes, student insights and engagement, re-vision for growth, to diversify and grow the international student markets, developing several geographical territories for growth, including the feasibility of growing the Dubai Hub and a UoB satellite site.

88.3   The approach that had been taken to the development of the workstreams and the pipeline of new programmes was discussed. It was explained the Deans had been involved in the development of the plan, with some projects being led by the Faculties. Workstreams had been presented to the Senior Leaders group and the next stage was for Faculties to progress to phase 2 to undertake detailed development in collaboration with programme teams, ensuring disciplinarity and a co-designed approach. The importance of having the capacity to develop ideas and programme teams having the freedom to explore and test ideas was raised.

88.4   The timeframe for the development of the workstreams was queried and it was confirmed that the next 3-4 months would be used to analyse the data and for the business cases to be developed. The initial data driven market insight for the new

pipeline of academic programmes was expected to be completed by end of May/early June, with the plan being presented to Council in July, for approval.

88.5   The importance of a managed approach to growth was noted, along with an understanding of the associated risks and the capacity required in Faculties to manage it.

88.6   The importance of a communication plan to support the plan was raised, and it was confirmed once a comprehensive approach had been agreed this would be communicated to all staff.

88.7   Senate **endorsed** the Institutional Growth and Sustainability Plan as outlined in the paper.

Strategy Updates on Faculty Priorities

The Deans presented updates on Faculty priorities, highlighting key risks and developments within their Faculties on the four areas of LTSE, R&I, EDI and BCE.

89.22-23   **Faculty of Engineering and Informatics (Document SEN077/22-23)**

89.1   The Dean of FoEI highlighted the following points:

LTSE:
- The advancing delivery impact of LTSES had resulted in improved NSS scores in 2022, however the IT facilities and temporary shortage of staff were a risk to the student experience and NSS 2023 results.
- Students were requesting suitable spaces to work more collaboratively.

R&I:
- A research vision workshop had been held in March to identify opportunities for research growth. Three bids had been submitted, two of which were in collaboration with other institutions and the outcome was due at the end of May on whether they would go to full proposals.
- The difficulty in recruitment of PGR students was noted as was the expectation that the KPI would not be met.

EDI:
- Activities were being delivered to ensure BME and female researchers had access to guidance, opportunities and support to become research supervisors.
- There had been a delay in arranging partnerships to achieve the participation in the Learning Partnership programme KPI, due to the timings making it difficult to have student input, and therefore it was expected the achievement of this KPI may be delayed until the next academic year.

BCE:
- Several engagements with the public and community were being undertaken, noting the Science Communication programme starting in 2023/24.
- Several new taught programme developments were being progressed.

89.2   A discussion was held around the decline in applications for PhD students and it was confirmed this was a national issue. The PVC R&I highlighted the need to develop an institutional Strategy to support this and to develop a plan for each Faculty to increase applications and success rates.

89.3   The importance of attracting PhD students was noted as was the strong return on investment, with more research being carried out and more outputs being produced. Issues regarding capacity to supervise PhD students in this area were noted and the intention to deliberately drive traffic to the website, highlighting the current capacity to supervise PhD students in certain areas.

90.22-23   **Faculty of Health Studies (Document SEN078/22-23)**

90.1   The Dean of FoHS highlighted the following points:

R&I:
- The continued pressure on time and resources available for staff to develop and deliver research was noted, this was being mitigated by recruitment of new staff and the implementation of the academic workload model. Ways to develop and increase research supervisors were being considered, including carrying out staff development which would also enable increased contributions to the next REF submission.

L&T:
- The impact of the imminent three day national nursing strike was expected to cause issues relating to student placements. However, a series of simulated placement opportunities and alternative virtual placement opportunities were being developed and positively received.
- The positive impact of the establishment of new governance groups to provide oversight of the implementation and delivery of KPIs was noted.

EDI:
- The key risk related to the capacity within staff workloads to advance work in the area of EDI, and this was being investigated.
- Building understanding of the revised EIA process to ensure earlier consideration of EDI impact was being progressed within the Faculty.

People Strategy:
- It was noted that the new Bradford Manager programme was being piloted in the Faculty with five workshops due to be completed by the end of July.

91.22-23   **Faculty of Life Sciences (Document SEN079/22-23)**

91.1   The Dean of FoLS highlighted the following points:

LTSE:
- Three programmes had failed to meet the 60% threshold for OfS graduate outcomes for the 2019/20 cohort. Mitigations had been put in place to enhance these programmes, including a redesign and reapproval of the programmes and building in an optional placement module.
- Student number targets had not been met in 2022/23 with reductions in enrolment on undergraduate programmes, and actions were being undertaken to mitigate risks including revised entry requirements, a reduction in chemistry programmes, and new programmes.
- Several events had been held including a pharmacy career fair, poster presentations, summer school research projects, etc to support work.

R&I:
- Delays in procurement processes had been identified as a single point of failure and therefore was a key risk.
- A Faculty Liaison academic had been appointed to engage with the procurement team, to ensure effective two way communication.
- A £3M Arts and Humanities Research Council for collections investment, had led to the purchase of a Cone Beam CT scanner for archaeological and forensic studies.

BCE:
- ICT staff had delivered a festival raising awareness on World Cancer Day in the Broadway shopping centre, which achieved good engagement in the work being undertaken.

EDI:
- The Faculty had supported the delivery of two Brad-iCOUNT projects, aimed at improving the student experience and inclusive practice.

92.22-23   **Faculty of Management, Law and Social Sciences (Document SEN080/22-23)**

92.1   The Dean of FoMLSS highlighted the following points:

LTSE:
- The Faculty Portfolio Monitoring Group had been established and good engagement was being experienced.
- The Faculty had achieved a high level response rate to the NSS.

R&I:

- Positive levels of grant submissions had been achieved, however there had not been any significant volume of awards in excess of £250k.
- Increased workload due to large student numbers was identified as a key risk, and work was being undertaken to consider ways to support this.

BCE:
- The relaunch of the ReMAKE@Bradford ex-offender entrepreneurship programme and Faculty community fellow programme were noted.
- Widening engagement in the Faculty in order to deliver on the objectives for local regeneration.
- Continued effort was being undertaken to raise the profile of the Faculty, including holding of mock trials linked to law firms and Deans dinners.

EDI:
- Minor revisions to the Athena Swan bronze submission have been completed and submitted.
- A key risk in this area was to sustain staff engagement, training and development in EDI.
- Graduate outcomes had identified four areas requiring attention in relation to OfS B3 conditions. It was noted that Psychology had poor progression outcomes nationally, however the Faculty was also underperforming based on its size. The Faculty is working with careers and programme teams to put action plans in place for programme areas scoring below the 60% OfS threshold in regards to students going on to further study, professional work or other positive outcomes within 15 months of graduating.

92.2 A discussion was held around the importance of identifying and focusing on the key priorities in the Faculty going forward.

93.22-23 **Ofsted visit – apprenticeships (oral update)**

93.1 The PVC LTSE presented an update on the recent monitoring visit carried out by Ofsted on 8 and 9 March 2023.

93.2 The visit confirmed that reasonable progress had been made in all four areas that had been identified as in need of improvement. Thanks was noted to all involved.

93.3 Senate was advised that it was anticipated that the next full monitoring visit would be carried out in 12 to 18 months.

94.22-23 **Update on PGR Progression (Document SEN081/22-23)**

94.1 The PVC R&I provided an overview of key changes to Postgraduate Research progression requirements for PhD students at the University and outlined the projects

underway to increase access and participation for black, asian and minority groups in postgraduate research study.

94.2   It was explained that 57 extensions to registration end dates for PGR students on the old regulations had been approved, to improve the student experience and put in new progression points to provide a more effective support system, to understand the student progression in a more effective manner and capture issues earlier.

94.3   A Brad-ATTAIN workshop had been scheduled for 22 May 2023 and research supervisors were encouraged to attend.

94.4   It was questioned whether the Doctoral Thesis Advisory Panel (DTAP) team could form part of the internal assessment group and it was confirmed that they could be part of the exam team later when needed, however the DTAP panel consisted of independent assessors and was introduced to ensure the process was fair and were not there to offer advice. A capacity issue regarding distribution of students to supervisors was noted and more training opportunities were needed to support supervisors, this would be taken forward outside of the Senate by the PVC R&I. The PVC EDI stressed the importance of diversity being built into the activity.

95.22-23   Student Success Report (oral update)

95.1   An update was provided by the Academic Registrar on the Student Success Report, noting that they were in the process of reviewing the report and that a full report would be presented to the next Senate.

95.2   **Action:** Student Success Report to be presented to the next meeting of Senate (Academic Registrar).

96.22-23   Annual report on Student Casework 2021-22 (Document SEN082/22-23)

96.1   The Academic Registrar presented the annual report on the cases received, investigated and resolved during 2021-22 on student complaints, academic appeals, academic misconduct including appeals, fitness to study, fitness to practise and disciplinary procedures.

96.2   Challenges had been experienced in meeting expected completion times for processing student casework, however the University remains in good standing with the OIA, with no cases being justified. An increase in staff resource in the student case work team has been introduced to meet the increase in number of cases, and this would improve the turnaround times going forward.

96.3   Key highlights included:
- There had been a significant year on year increase in the number for formal appeals and that extenuating circumstances remained the main reason for appeals.

- There had been seven cases on sexual harassment, misconduct or assault and it was noted that there was a new approach to regulating harassment and sexual misconduct in higher education and it was expected that the number of cases would increase.
- A casework management system was being considered to increase oversight of the current caseload and support monitoring of cases.
- Comparative data would be included in the subsequent reports on disciplinary cases.

96.4 A discussion was held on the timescales for reporting a potential incident of academic misconduct and whether the current regulation already recommended 6 weeks, and it was commented that following changes to Regulation 5: Academic Misconduct had worked much better this year.

96.5 **Action:** to confirm if 6 weeks was already in the regulation (Academic Registrar).

96.6 Senate considered and **approved** the following recommendations set out in the report:
- To review, enhance and embed the information provided to students about good academic practice, identifying best practice across a range of disciplines.
- For Faculties to undertake further analysis of the data where students who appear to be overrepresented in casework. This will enable better understanding of the reasons for appeal, complaint or misconduct cases from students.
- To review the number of students who engage with the online academic integrity induction module as well as other measures taken at Faculty and programme level to reinforce the University's expectations including measures taken to follow with students.

96.7 <u>SECRETARY'S NOTE:</u> It was confirmed after the meeting that the recommended 6 weeks was already in the regulation and therefore this recommendation did not need approving.

97.22-23 **NSS update (oral update)**

97.1 The PVC LTSE explained that the National Student Survey had been launched nationally on 11 January 2023 and closed on 30 April 2023, with results due to be published in summer 2023.

97.2 Overall the University had met the required response rate publication threshold, however six courses which had low student numbers had not met the required response rate.

97.3 It was highlighted that there was currently a consultation being undertaken on the approach to publishing the results for 2023 and beyond, noting this closed on 26 May 2023.

97.4   Thanks was noted to Associate Deans facilitating response rates and all involved in the NSS.

98.22-23   **OfS update (oral update)**

98.1   The PVC LTSE provided an update on the OfS published annual dashboards that included the latest student data up to the 2021-22 academic year in regard to student outcomes, sector distributions of student outcomes and size and shape of provision.

98.2   The OfS had published the areas of prioritisation over the next year, and consultation was ongoing in relation to the approach to publication of results of the NSS and a new approach to regulating harassment and sexual misconduct in English Higher Education.

98.3   **Action:** The outcomes of the data dashboards would be circulated to members (PVC LTSE).

99.22-23   **People Matters (Document SEN083/22-23)**

99.1   The Deputy Director of People provided a summary on current matters relating to the workforce and the work being undertaken within the People and Organisational Development Service which included an update on the integrated planning process, UCU industrial action, and latest pay gap data.

99.2   The following points were highlighted:
- Integrated planning process – planning meetings were being held in April and May, reviewing plans for the coming year including key workforce and organisational development considerations.
- Recruitment –the success in attracting new recruiters was noted, as was the increase in the workforce of 170 since February 2022. These numbers were encouraging given the challenging recruitment market and difficulty appointing to specialist posts.
- UCU industrial action – following a successful ballot UCU had renewed their mandates for strike action and action short of strike until 30 September 2023. A marking and assessment boycott has been indicated, with Dean's and local leadership teams planning mitigation to limit impact.
- Events – the outstanding achiever awards was being held this week with 20 long serving members receiving 25 year service awards and Team Bradford was scheduled for 23 May 2023.
- Director of People, Culture and Wellbeing – the advert closed early April, with interviews being held in May. A good field of candidates had been received and it was expected that an announcement on the appointment would be made in June subject to notice periods.

99.3   The proportion of the workforce in academic roles had increased from 37% to 40% following an increase in headcount. Many institutions externally outsource cleaning staff and if these staff were to be taken out of the calculations, this would increase

the academic staff percentages up to 42-43%. This was slightly below the sector average of 50%, however it was expected the percentage would increase with the further recruitment as part of the University growth plan.

100.22-23 **ESFA Review (Document SEN084/22-23)**

100.1 The Academic Registrar noted the ESFA Funding Assurance Review conducted by Price Waterhouse Cooper on behalf of the ESFA had commenced in August 2022, closing in February 2023.

100.2 The ESFA funding review had looked at financial compliance with their regulations. Based on preliminary findings five recommendations for improvement had been identified.

101.22-23 **APP update (Document SEN085/22-23)**

101.1 The PVC EDI provided an update on the APP, noting the update on the 11 workstreams provided in the report. The PVC EDI explained that the University was not required to submit a revised plan until spring/summer 2024, which allowed time to carry out the quantitative work and work to be undertaken to develop the new APP.

102.22-23 **University of Bradford International College (UBIC) update (Document SEN086/22-23)**

102.1 Senate received and noted the report.

103.22-23 **Student Recruitment (Document SEN087/22-23)**

103.1 Senate received and noted the report.

104.22-23 **Prevent update (Document SEN088/22-23)**

104.1 Senate received the report and noted the publication of the Independent Review of Prevent by William Shawcross CVO. The PVC LTSE highlighted recommendations 28 and 33 to be addressed and noted with confidence that these could be responded. See link to the review report detailing the recommendations: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1134828/The_response_to_the_Independent_Review_of_Prevent.pdf

105.22-23 **Learning and Teaching Committee (Document SEN089/22-23)**

105.1 Senate received and noted the report.

106.22-23 **Ethics Committee (Document SEN090/22-23)**

106.1 Senate received and noted the report.

107.22-23 **Research and Innovation Committee (Document SEN091/22-23)**

107.1 Senate received and noted the report.

108.22-23 **Faculty of Health Studies (Document SEN092/22-23)**

108.1 Senate received and noted the report.

109.22-23 **Faculty of Life Sciences (Document SEN093/22-23)**

109.1 Senate received and noted the report.

110.22-23 **Faculty of Management, Law and Social Sciences (Document SEN094/22-23)**

110.1 Senate received and noted the report.

111.22-23 **Register of Interests (Document SEN095/22-23)**

111.1 Senate received and noted the report.

112.22-23 **Senate January 1 February 2023 (Document SEN096/22-23)**

112.1 The minutes of the meeting held on the 1 February 2023 were approved by circulation prior to the meeting.

113.22-23 **Joint Senate/LTC 11 January 2023 (Document SEN097/22-23)**

113.1 The minutes of the Joint meeting of Senate and Learning and Teaching Committee held on the 11 January 2023 to consider TEF submission were approved.

114.22-23 **Matters arising and action tracker (Document SEN098/22-23)**

114.1 Senate received and noted the updates on the actions from previous meetings.

114.2 It was noted that Chair's Action had been taken on the approval of the final KEF narrative statements as agreed at a previous meeting of Senate.

115.22-23 **Draft agenda for Senate 4: 12 July 2023**

115.1 Senate received and noted the report.

116.22-23 **Schedule of Business 2022-23 (Document SEN100/22-23)**

116.1 Senate received and noted the report.

117.22-23 **Terms of reference and membership 2022-23 (Document SEN101/22-23)**

117.1 Senate received and noted the report.

118.22-23 **Any other business**

118.1 None

Secretary: Rachel Trawally
Date: May 2023